Rethinking Autonomy
Rethinking Autonomy

A Critique of Principism in Biomedical Ethics

JOHN W. TRAPHAGAN

SUNY PRESS
For my lovely daughter, Sarah
# Contents

Acknowledgments ix

1. Inventing Ethics 1
   1.1 The Problem of Common Morality 1
   1.2 Embodied Culture 9
   1.3 Thinking About Culture 12
   1.4 What Is Culture? 13
   1.5 Memory, Culture, Ethics 23

2. Self, Autonomy, and Body 27
   2.1 Principles and Ethics 27
   2.2 Autonomy 32
   2.3 What Is a Human? 36
   2.4 Culture, Mind, and Body 41
   2.5 Categories of Person and Self 51
   2.6 The Nature of Humans 58
   2.7 Mind and Body, Inside and Outside 59

3. Autonomy and Japanese Self-Concepts 63
   3.1 Self and Other 63
   3.2 The Individual Self 70
   3.3 Self and Childhood Development 72
   3.4 The Processive Self 74
   3.5 Moral Selves and Autonomy 75

4. Autonomies, Virtue, and Social Change 79
   4.1 Self, Virtue, and Character 79
   4.2 Family, Self, Society 83
   4.3 Autonomy, Family, and Social Change 88
5. Mental Health, Suicide, and Self-Centered Behavior 95
   5.1 Self and Other 95
   5.2 Suicide as Medical and Analytical Category 98
   5.3 Suicide and Self-Killing in Japan 102
   5.4 Death 111

   6.1 Situational Ethics in Japan 119
   6.2 The Obasuteyama Legend 121
   6.3 Harmony and Sincerity 129
   6.4 Japanese Ethics 131

7. Rethinking Autonomy 135

References 147

Index 159
Acknowledgments

Parts of Chapters 2 and 3 are significantly revised portions of articles. “Senility as Disintegrated Person in Japan” originally appeared in the Journal of Cross-Cultural Gerontology 17:253–67 (Traphagan 2002), “The Oddness of Things: Morality Games and Interpretations of Social Change Among Elders in Rural Japan” originally appeared in The Asia Pacific Journal of Anthropology 10(4):329–47 (Traphagan 2009). These are included here with kind permission of Springer Science and Business Media and Taylor and Francis (http://www.informaworld.com), respectively. Chapter 4 originally appeared as “Interpretations of Elder Suicide, Stress, and Dependency Among Rural Japanese” in Ethnology (Traphagan 2004b), and I am very appreciative of that journal for allowing me to use the article here. Data for this book were collected during several trips to Japan between 1995 and 2010, funded by a variety of sources, including a Fulbright Doctoral Research Fellowship and grants from the Michigan Exploratory Center for the Demography of Aging, the Northeast Asia Council of the Association for Asian Studies, The American Philosophical Society, the Wenner-Gren Foundation for Anthropological Research, the National Institute on Aging (grant number R03 AG016111-01), and the Mitsubishi Japan Endowment at the University of Texas at Austin. The support is greatly appreciated.

There are numerous people to thank for support and comments throughout the writing of this book. First, I thank Kirsten Cather, Robert Oppenheim, and Thomas Tweed of the University of Texas at Austin and L. Keith Brown of the University of Pittsburgh for their very helpful comments on various drafts. Second, many thanks to my father, Willis Traphagan, for content and editorial comments throughout writing. The work also benefited from the help of my assistant Emiko Miyagawa Linville who gathered some of the sources used, Maeri Megumi who reviewed Japanese terms for accuracy, and Anthony Wright who